GOVERNING BODY
Confirmed minutes
Sixty-eighth meeting of Governing Body Wednesday 11 March 2020

{} indicates that this item will be removed prior to publication on the College website.

Present: Dr Anthony Freeling (President, Chair), Dr Hilary Burton (Vice-President), Mr Mark Anderson, Dr Stephen Axford (Director of Research Translation), Prof Michael Barrett, Mr William Charnley (from item 68.4), Dr Othman Cole, Prof Gishan Dissanaike, Dr Claire Donnelly, Prof John Doorbar, Dr Peter Dudley, Mrs Victoria Espley (Bursar), Prof Tamsin Ford, Dr Markus Gehring (to item 68.18), Prof Emanuele Giovannetti, Dr Danika Hill, Dr Sarah Hoare (from item 68.3), Dr Philip Johnston (Senior Tutor), Dr Tobias Kohn, Dr Alastair Lockhart, Dr Timea Nochta, Prof William Nuttall, Mrs Laurel Powers-Freeling, Dr Corinne Roughley, Dr Ricardo Sabates, Dr Carole Sargent, Dr Kishore Sengupta, Dr Eugene Shwageraus, Dr Martin Steinfeld (from item 68.4), Prof Andreas Stylianides, Prof Paul Tracey, Dr Lars Vinx, Prof Rupert Wegerif, Dr Clive Wells, Dr Jessica White (from item 68.4).

In attendance: Mrs Wendy Solomou (College Secretary and Fellowships Manager, Secretary).

Apologies: Prof Jonathan Powell (Pro-Vice-President), Dr Mark Bale, Dr Heather Blackmore, Dr Stephen Cave, Mr Martin Coleman, Mr Bill Conner (Director of Institutional Advancement), Dr Bart de Nijs, Dr Bernard Devereux, Prof Ming-Qing Du, Dr Fernando Gonzalez-Zalba, Dr Sonia Ilie, Prof Bill Irish, Dr Agnieszka Iwasiewicz-Wabnig, Prof James Kaufman, Dr Yury Korolev, Dr Andrew Mackintosh, Prof Neil Mercer (Senior Independent Fellow), Dr Ajith Parlikad, Dr Aisling Redmond, Prof Nidhi Singal, Dr Jeffrey Skopek, Dr Jacob Stegenga, Dr Caroline Trotter, Dr Vanessa Wong, Dr Nigel Yandell.

On leave: Dr Sara Hennessy, Dr Suzanne Turner.

Absent: Mr Nick Gray, Mr Tim Pilkington.

OPEN BUSINESS

68.1. Introduction

68.1.1. Welcome

The President welcomed three new Fellows, Prof Tamsin Ford, Dr Tobias Kohn and Dr Timea Nochta to their first meeting of Governing Body.
68.1.2. Declarations of Interests (Open Business)

There were no declarations of interests.

68.2. Minutes and Matters arising from the Open Business of the Sixty-seventh meeting of Governing Body, 5 February 2020

68.2.1. Approval of minutes (GB68 01)

Governing Body approved the minutes as an accurate record.

68.2.2. Matters arising

There were no matters arising.

68.3. President’s Report

- College: The Bridge had organised several interesting events that had raised its profile; the Boat Club had enjoyed successes in the Lent Bumps.
- Wider University: strikes were ongoing; recent adverse media coverage on the handling of sexual misconduct complaints in one of the colleges was likely to lead to a further rethinking of policy in the collegiate University; Coronavirus (COVID-19) was high on the agenda and likely to dominate in the coming term.

68.4. Business continuity planning for the ongoing threat posed by Coronavirus (COVID-19)

The Bursar and Dr Roughley (Deputy Senior Tutor, Welfare), respective leads for contingency planning for operations and student welfare/health, gave Governing Body a comprehensive update on the College’s response to the challenges and risks posed by the Coronavirus. The Bursar went through the most recent version of the College’s COVID-19 Risk Register, giving examples of actions being taken – for example, all administrative staff had been set up so that they could work online from home. Dr Roughley explained how the College planned to support those students who remained in College.

Several Fellows expressed satisfaction with the proactive planning and actions being taken. In response to a question about whether the University and colleges would close, the President said that the University would not act ahead of a directive from Public Health England. He added that there was a risk that students would not be admitted in September and confirmed that the Bursar would undertake financial modelling to determine how the College would be affected by a range of scenarios.

It was agreed that future social gatherings, including Formal Halls, should be cancelled after the coming Friday (13 March).

68.5. Appointment of the auditors for 2020-21, for the audit of the 2019-20 accounts (GB68 02)

Governing Body approved Audit Committee’s recommendation that PEM be appointed as auditors for the financial year 2019/20 with an extension to the following two years subject to satisfactory delivery of services.
68.6. The Bridge – moving forwards

68.6.1. Strategy (GB68 03)

The President spoke to the paper, which gave recommendations from the Working Group for the future strategy and focus of The Bridge. The paper had been considered by the Bridge Committee and Council: both were satisfied with the proposed changes to approach. The President asked if Governing Body was content with the general recommended direction for progressing the Bridge, noting that the organisational aspects of the proposed changes would be dealt with in Reserved Business.

Governing Body approved the recommendations.

68.6.2. ***Bridge Committee criteria for establishing new Themes and Centres (GB68 04)

Governing Body received the paper without discussion.

68.7. Hughes Hall Centre for Climate Change Engagement (HHCCE) and Chapter Zero – governance issues (GB68 05)

The President spoke to the paper which proposed that Hughes Hall formalise its relationship with Chapter Zero by becoming the sole member of Chapter Zero Limited (registered in the United Kingdom as a company limited by guarantee, with liability limited to £1 for each member).

The Bridge Centre, HHCCE, had developed a partnership with Chapter Zero that had proved highly effective in promoting engagement with the corporate and financial sectors (one of HHCCE’s primary mission aims). The College provided resources to Chapter Zero, primarily through staff on secondment, but also by administering payments through a restricted fund and providing meeting room space and data storage facilities. However, the College did not have a direct legal relationship with Chapter Zero and there was a risk that legal liability could attach to Hughes Hall instead of, or as well as, to Chapter Zero. It was therefore important to establish a clearly defined legal relationship between each organisation. The President added that by establishing a formal link with Chapter Zero the College would be better placed to attract substantial funding, including raising money jointly with the University through CUDAR.

The proposal was to replace the eight current members of Chapter Zero with Hughes Hall as sole member, together with some revisions to the Company’s articles and further provisions in an MOU. As sole member the College would have the power to appoint and dismiss members of the Board of Directors and the articles would include a short list of agreed ‘reserved matters’ on which Directors would need to get agreement from Hughes Hall before taking decisions. However, the intention was that, whilst decisions about overall strategy and annual budget would be made jointly with the Board, the College would not be involved in the day-to-day running of Chapter Zero – the proposed balance of membership of the Board of Directors was six externals and two Hughes Hall representatives.

The President pointed out that it was not yet known how the current Chapter Zero members would wish to reach an agreement, and that they could respond to the letter of intent with counter proposals.
In discussion the following concerns were raised:

(1) Was the model of single membership with limited influence on the day-to-day running of Chapter Zero appropriate? Could issues of control be sufficiently addressed by the list of ‘reserved matters’ in the revised articles?

(2) What were the attendant risks - financial, contractual, reputational (for example, could the existence of the association with Chapter Zero discourage links with other initiatives), and operational (would the amount of resources devoted by the College be disproportionate)?

(3) The nature of the legal relationship, for example, would Chapter Zero be included in the College’s consolidated accounts?

One Fellow expressed the view that it was difficult for those without a business background to fully grasp the issues and to understand precisely how Chapter Zero operated.

The option of cutting ties with the organisation was raised but, given the role of Chapter Zero in successfully delivering one of HHHCE’s main mission objectives and the potential for attracting further substantial funding, it was agreed that the possibility of formalising the arrangement should be pursued and that the issues raised should be explored in more detail.

It was agreed that the President would establish a Working Group to consist of those expressing views during the discussion, to include Fellows with academic and business backgrounds. The remit of the group was to develop a view on due diligence, risks that might be incurred and approaches to mitigate them. The Working Group would report to Council for discussion and the final proposal would be submitted to Governing Body for a decision.

**ACTION:** President to set up this Working Group and Fellows to volunteer to it.

**68.8. Amendments to Ordinances: (GB68 06)**

Governing Body approved Governance Committee’s recommendations for amendments to Ordinances for items 68.8.1-4 as outlined in the paper. Item 68.8.5 was approved subject to a small, further amendment suggested in the paper (the removal of ‘senior’, in the second line of Ordinance [C,I,27]).

The amendments approved by Governing Body are given in Appendix A to the minutes of Open Business.

**68.8.1. Estates Committee – Ordinance [D,II,5] (p.2)**

**68.8.2. House Committee – Ordinance [D,III,1-3] (p.3)**

**68.8.3. Admissions Committee – Ordinance [D,II,1] (p.4)**

**68.8.4. General provisions for committees – Ordinance [D,I,16] (p.5)**

**68.8.5. New category of Senior Membership, Visiting Associate [A.X.3; C,I,1,8,10,27] (pp.6-8)**

**68.9. Management accounts update (GB68 07)**

Governing Body received the management accounts update. The President noted that when the data were next presented there would be significant changes to the College’s financial position.
68.10. Any other Open Business

There was no other Open Business.

End of Open Business WS
Appendix A: Amendments to Ordinances approved by Governing Body

Estates Committee – Ordinance [D,II,5]

5. The Estates Committee shall be responsible to the Council for overseeing the maintenance and development of College buildings and grounds, and the implementation of any projects to alter or extend or reduce the extent of the buildings or grounds. For these purposes the Committee shall:
   (a) be responsible for long-term strategic planning;
   (b) approve the design and build elements of any building project assigned to its oversight by the Council, including any project for refurbishing existing buildings, subject to the budget agreed by the Council;
   (c) report any changes to an agreed design and build proposal, to the Council and to the Governing Body, before entering into any binding commitments to third parties;
   (d) monitor the progress of any building project assigned to it, in particular its delivery to time and budget;
   (e) oversee the purchase or sale of, or any other legal other agreement concerning, any land or buildings or any interest in any land or buildings of the College, including Student hostels.

House Committee – Ordinance [D,III,1-3]

1. The House Committee shall be an advisory committee to the Bursar, appointed in accordance with Ordinance [D,I], and shall be composed of:
   (a) one member of the Council (Chair);
   (b) the Bursar;
   (c) the Head of Domestic Operations;
   (d) the IT Manager;
   (e) four further members appointed from among the GB Fellows and Research Associates;
   (f) up to three Students nominated by the MCR Committee.

2. The Committee shall keep under review all aspects of accommodation, IT provision, catering and use of College buildings and estates, including green and sustainability matters. For these purposes, the Committee shall:
   (a) provide regular feedback and advice to the Bursar;
   (b) propose, discuss, review and support current projects;
   (c) consider and propose matters of strategic development and future planning;
   (d) facilitate communication and discussion among the Fellows, other Senior Members, the Assistant Staff and Students;

3. The Committee shall normally meet once a Term and shall have the following standing items on the agenda:
   (a) accommodation;
   (b) IT provision;
   (c) catering;
(d) buildings and estate management;
(e) green and sustainability matters.

Admissions Committee – Ordinance [D,II,1]

1. The Admissions Committee shall be a standing committee of the Council, appointed in accordance with Statute [IX,I] and Ordinance [D,I]. The Committee shall meet at least twice a year, normally in the Michaelmas and Easter Terms, and additionally as necessary. The Committee shall be composed of:
   (a) the President;
   (b) the Senior Tutor (Chair);
   (c) the Admissions Tutors;
   (d) the Education Manager;
   (e) three further GB Fellows.
   An Admissions Administrator, appointed by the Chair, shall act as administrative secretary.

General provisions for committees - Ordinances [D,I,16]

16. A committee shall be quorate when at least half of the membership is present and at least one member serving ex officio, who need not be the Chair, but who must be a Governing Body Fellow. Any vote taken at a meeting which is quorate shall be a valid vote, irrespective of the number of members voting aye or nay or abstaining.

New category of Senior Membership ‘Visiting Associate’

Ordinance [A,X,3 (c)]

3. The Fellowships Committee shall be responsible to the Governing Body for:
   (a) making recommendations for the election and re-election of Fellows in Classes A-G and Titular Fellows other than Visiting Fellows;
   (b) the appointment and re-appointment of By-Fellows, Associates, and Research Associates;
   (c) the appointment of Affiliates, Visiting Fellows and Visiting Associates;
   (d) the conduct of Fellowship re-election procedures under Statute [IV,2], other than:
       (i) the re-election of any member of the Academic Staff, as defined by the Academic Staff Statute; or
       (ii) any review held at the expiry of a fixed-term contract of employment, or at the completion of a probationary period of employment, held in conjunction with a Fellowship;
       any such review or re-election shall be held in accordance with Ordinance [C,I,32(c)] or [C,I,34], as appropriate.

Ordinance [C,I,1]
1. The College community of Members shall comprise:
   (a) the President;
   (b) Fellows in Classes A-G under Statute [IV,1];
   (c) Former Presidents under Ordinance [A,II,11];
   (d) Titular Fellows under Statute V (Honorary Fellows, Pfeiffer Fellows, Quondam Fellows, Former Fellows and Visiting Fellows);
   (e) By-Fellows, Associates, Research Associates and Affiliates;
   (f) Visiting Associates and Academic Visitors;
   (g) Students of the College, both undergraduate and postgraduate;
   (h) Alumni of the College, that is, any person who at any time has been a Student member.

Ordinance [C,I,8 (e)]

8. Senior Members shall comprise:
   (a) the President;
   (b) Fellows in all Classes and Titles;
   (c) Former Presidents;
   (d) By-Fellows, Associates, Research Associates and Affiliates;
   (e) Visiting Associates.

Ordinance [C,I,10 (b)]

10. The Election of Fellows and the appointment of other Senior Members shall normally be made on the recommendation of the Fellowships Committee, under Ordinance [A,X,3(a)-(c)]:
   (a) Fellows in Classes A-G, and Titular Fellows other than Visiting Fellows, shall be elected by the Governing Body;
   (b) By-Fellows, Visiting Fellows, Associates, Research Associates, Affiliates and Visiting Associates shall be appointed by the Fellowship Committee.

Ordinance [C,I,27]

27. Visiting Associates: either a person normally holding a doctorate, whose visit is not deemed as justifying election as a Visiting Fellow, or a professional planning to collaborate in research translation activity with one or more Senior Members of the College, may be appointed as a Visiting Associates for a maximum period of one year, which shall not normally be renewed. Visiting Scholars shall have the same privileges as Associates.
RESERVED BUSINESS

68.11. Declarations of members’ interests (Reserved Business)

Dr Axford declared an interest in 67.16 and left the room when the item was discussed.

Dr Doorbar declared an interest in 67.18 and left the room when the item was discussed.


68.12.1. Approval of minutes (GB68 08)

Governing Body approved the minutes as an accurate record.

68.12.2. Matters arising

There were no matters arising.

68.13. Requests for leaves of absence

Leaves of absence were granted to Prof Paul Tracey for Lent and Easter terms 2021, and to Prof Gishan Dissanaike for Easter term 2021.

68.14. Recommendations for appointments from Fellowships Committee (GB68 09)

The following appointments were approved:

**Election to Class A**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>From</th>
<th>To</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr Riikka Hofmann</td>
<td>11 Mar 2020</td>
<td>10 Mar 2023</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Election to Class B (Cambridge Philosophical Society Henslow Fellow)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>From</th>
<th>To</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr Livia Tomova</td>
<td>1 Oct 2020</td>
<td>30 Sept 2023</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
68.15. ***Appointments made by Fellowships Committee (GB68 10)***

Governing Body noted the following appointments as Affiliate made by Fellowships Committee (not reported in the previous update to Governing Body on 5 February 2020):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nominee</th>
<th>From</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr Ana Perez</td>
<td>15 Jan 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Tim Pilkington</td>
<td>1 Apr 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Sid Simmons</td>
<td>1 Apr 2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

68.16. **Remuneration Committee’s recommendation for the new Post of Director of Strategy and the Bridge (GB68 11)**

Governing Body noted the terms and conditions of the new College Post of Director of Strategy and the Bridge and approved Remuneration Committee’s recommendation that the Post be remunerated at Grade 10 on the University of Cambridge Single Salary Spine Point Scale (£55,751 to £64,604). Governing Body also noted that the establishment of the new Post would necessitate some amendments to the College Ordinances which would be submitted in Easter Term following further consideration by Council and Governance Committee.

68.17. **Elections to Committees (GB68 12)**

The following candidates nominated by Governance Committee were declared elected, since the number of nominations for each committee was less than or equal to the number of vacancies and no member of Governing Body required that an election be held (Ordinance [D,I,13]).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Nominee</th>
<th>Term</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fellowships</td>
<td>Dr Caroline Trotter</td>
<td>11 Mar 2020 to 31 Aug 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Strategy</td>
<td>Dr Pete Dudley</td>
<td>11 Mar 2020 to 31 Aug 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Strategy</td>
<td>Dr Ricardo Sabates</td>
<td>1 Apr 2020 to 31 Aug 2022</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

68.18. **Election of Vice-President**

Prof John Doorbar was elected Vice-President from 1 September 2020 to 31 August 2021.

68.19. **Elections to Council (GB68 13)**

Governing Body agreed to defer holding the elections to the following meeting to allow more time for Fellows to volunteer to stand.

68.20. **Any other Reserved Business**

It was noted that the meeting of 24 June 2020 would be brought forward to 6 May 2020 and that it would be held via video conference.

Dr Roughley reminded Fellows to respond to the Equality and Diversity in the Senior Membership Survey that had recently been sent to all Senior Members.

End of Reserved Business WS