Confirmed Minutes

Fifty-fifth meeting of Governing Body, 14 June 2017

{} indicates that this item will be removed prior to publication on the College website.

OPEN BUSINESS

Present: Dr Anthony Freeling (President, Chair), Prof James Kaufman (Vice-President), Dr Hilary Burton (Pro-Vice-President), Prof Nabeel Affara, Dr John Barker, Prof Michael Barrett, Dr Martin Bellamy, Prof Mary Buckley, Dr Paula De Oliveira-Banca, Dr Bernard Devereux, Prof Gishan Dissanaike, Prof John Doorbar, Dr Peter Dudley, Mrs Victoria Espley (Bursar), Dr Fernando Gonzalez-Zalba, Dr Sara Hennessy, Dr Danika Hill, Prof Ian Hodge, Dr Sonia Illie, Dr Agnieszka Iwasiewicz-Wabnig, Dr Philip Johnston (Senior Tutor), Dr Arne Jungwirth, Dr Bianca Jupp, Dr Alastair Lockhart, Dr Ajith Parlikad, Dr Charles Pigott, Prof Jonathan Powell (to item 55.6), Dr Aisling Redmond, Dr Sarah Rough, Dr Corinne Roughley (to 55.10), Prof Kenneth Ruthven, Dr Carole Sargent, Dr Kishore Sengupta, Dr Eugene Shwageraus, Dr Jeffrey Skopek, Dr Jacob Stegenga, Dr Caroline Trotter, Dr Clive Wells, Dr Jessica White (from 55.10), Dr Nigel Yandell.

In Attendance: Mr Rupert Pearce-Gould (to 55.15), Mr John Raffan, (Senior Independent Fellow) (to 55.15), Mrs Wendy Solomou (College Secretary and Fellowships Manager, Secretary).

Apologies: Dr Mark Bale, Dr Heather Blackmore, Mr William Charnley, Dr Lydia Drumright, Prof Ming-Qing Du, Dr Andrew Gould, Mr Nick Gray, Dr Sara Melville, Prof William Nuttall, Prof Gordon Smith, Dr Martin Steinfeld, Dr Suzanne Turner.

On leave: Dr Marcus Gehring, Dr Nidhi Singal, Dr Elizabeth Swann, Prof Paul Tracey.

In memoriam

Mr Richard Thomas Johannes Berg Rust, M.A., B.A. (CNAA), M.A. (Durham) Development Director and Fellow, 2013-17, died on 11 April 2017

Mr Roy Lionel Helmore, CBE, MA, Fellow 1982-94, Life Fellow 1994-2017, former Principal of Cambridgeshire College of Arts and Technology (CCAT), 1977-86, died on 11 May 2017
55.1. Welcome and introduction

The President welcomed three new Fellows - Dr De Oliveira-Banca, Prof Doorbar, and Dr Gonzalez-Zalba - to their first meeting of Governing Body. He also welcomed Mr Pearce-Gould, who, as Interim Development Director, had been invited to attend the meeting.

Dr Freeling thanked the Fellows who were leaving or retiring from Governing Body - Prof Affara, Dr Bellamy, Dr Gould, Prof Ruthven, and Prof Smith - and acknowledged their contribution to the College.

55.2. Declarations of Interests

There were no declarations of interests other than for the elections in Reserved Business. It was agreed that Fellows would declare their interests and leave the room as the relevant item(s) arose.

55.3. Minutes and Matters arising from the Fifty-fourth meeting of Governing Body on Wednesday 15 March 2017 (GB55 01)

The minutes were approved as an accurate record, subject to the following correction:

- Page 3, penultimate line: ‘Ordnances’ corrected to ‘Ordinances’.

55.4. Governing Body Action List (GB55 02)

- 53.4 Possible replacement options for painting in Dining Hall.
  Dr Lockhart, acting Chair of the sub-committee, gave an update on progress. The Fitzwilliam Museum and a small number of galleries in the eastern region had been approached concerning the possibility of loaning artwork. The sub-committee would await responses before making any further enquires.

- 52.2.1 Bursar to re-activate the Elizabeth Phillips Hughes Hall Company to deal with increased conference income. To be finalised in Michaelmas Term 2017.

55.5. The President’s Report

The President thanked Dr Johnston and others on the organising committee for arranging the memorial event to celebrate the life of Fellow and Development Director, Richard Berg Rust. The occasion had been attended by members of his family who had expressed their appreciation of the event. He reported that sufficient funds had been raised for the College to purchase a new boat for the rowing club and that fund-raising was ongoing for the establishment of a lecture series on literature from the North of England.

[REDACTED]

Finally, the President mentioned that the Study Centres initiatives were making good progress and that the Centre for Digital Innovation (CDI) had now raised sufficient funds to recruit a director.
55.6. The Bridge (GB 55 03)

The President spoke to the paper, which outlined a proposal for a new and major strategic initiative to provide support to researchers, both students and Fellows, when they seek to translate research into policy, practice or products.

Dr Freeling noted that many of those sitting on Governing Body were already familiar with the proposal. The proposed initiative had developed out of a series of ‘Making it happen’ workshops, in which Fellows and others had participated. The draft proposal had initially been brought to Council for discussion and further input and had also been presented at the Senior Members’ Symposium on 4 May 2017. Various aspects of the proposal, including its budget and governance arrangements had been considered by Finance Committee (8 May), Study Centres Committee (10 May), and Governance Committee (17 May). The revised proposal had been received by Council on 31 May.

The timetable outlined for the rolling out of the initiative was:

- **Year 1-2 – initiate and establish** core Bridge infrastructure, relationships and activities. The main output should be some initial pilots, especially with regard to training and a strong sense of who will be the initial partners, with some agreements signed. An early activity for Bridge leadership will be to develop an ‘Ecosystem Map’ to understand the resources currently available across the University and beyond and to identify and negotiate with partner organisations.

- **Years 3-4 – extend and institutionalise** its activities, reach and reputation. This will include bedding-in the findings from the trial activities and developing case studies. There would also be an expansion of activities, partnerships and outputs in directions such as an apprenticeship programme or a membership offer for brokering services.

The specific management proposal was for the appointment of a full-time Office of Director of ‘The Bridge’ attached to a Fellowship, to be supported by at least one research analyst and by a full-time, relatively senior administrator.

Governance Committee had recommended that the Director report directly to Council, while the Study Centres Committee be reconstituted and renamed to act as an advisory committee to both The Bridge and to the Study Centres; its membership to be expanded to include the leadership of The Bridge and the frequency of its meeting to be increased.

A number of Fellows spoke in favour of the proposal and expressed the view that both the College and the wider collegiate University would benefit from the initiative. Dr Trotter volunteered to write up existing case studies to illustrate ways in which the translation of research into practice could be achieved. The President requested that Fellows send examples to Dr Trotter.

Governing Body gave its unanimous approval of the proposal.
55.7. Budget 2017-18 (GB55 04)

The Bursar presented the proposed income and expenditure budget for 2017-18.

In response to questions raised as to whether there were any potential risks that would adversely affect income, the Bursar responded that that the main risk would be a shortfall in predicted student numbers, which would not only affect income from fees, but also income from catering and, to a lesser extent, from accommodation. However, any reduction in income would be partly offset by a reduction in costs. Other risks, such as the loss of a building, would be covered by business continuity insurance and potential inflationary increases in costs above the current rate of inflation had been factored into the forecast. The Bursar also clarified that any reduction in the funds transferred from the Colleges Fund to Hughes Hall was not a risk factor for the budget, because the grant would be transferred to the College’s endowment fund and had not been included in the budget as operational income.

Governing Body approved the proposed income and expenditure budget for 2017-18.

The President thanked the Bursar for the clear and transparent methods used to prepare and present the budget.

55.8. Appointment of Auditors (GB55 05)

Dr Bellamy, as a member of the Audit Committee, spoke to the paper, which described the process followed by the Audit Committee in seeking and considering the tenders of external auditors and the rationale for their recommendation. The Audit Committee recommended the re-appointment of Price Bailey as external auditors.

Governing Body approved the recommendation.

The President noted that there were plans to introduce an internal audit in the coming year in order to obtain independent assurance that the College’s risk management, governance and internal control processes were operating effectively.

55.9. Amendment to Ordinances (GB55 06)

Governance Committee recommended a small number of amendments to the College Ordinances, as given in Appendix A to the minutes. The amendments concerned the following:

- The renaming of the Strategic Development Group as the ‘Development Strategy Group’
- The annual College Accounts would not need the approval of Council following presentation at the Audit Meeting of Governing Body
- The presentation of the College Accounts to Governing Body in Michaelmas Term did not need to be tied to the first meeting, held in October, but could be reported at the second meeting of the Michaelmas Term.
- The establishment of a quorum specifically for the Audit Committee
• The new Assistant Staff post of Head of Facilities to serve *ex officio* on the Estates Committee

• The new Assistant Staff post of Head of Domestic Operations to serve *ex officio* on the House Committee

Dr Lockhart questioned the proposed quorum for the Audit Committee, since it would, theoretically, be possible for the meeting to be quorate without the presence of a Governing Body Fellow. The President asked that Governing Body approve the amendments as recommended, but agreed that the Governance Committee would consider whether there needed to be a further amendment to consider the query raised.

Governing Body approved the amendments to College Ordinances as recommended by Governance Committee.

**ACTION:** The Secretary to refer the issue raised by Dr Lockhart to Governance Committee for further consideration.

**55.10.** What can the Fellowship do to help increase the number of doctoral students in College (GB55 07)

The President informed Governing Body that the College had met its 2016-17 target of graduate admissions for one-year courses at master’s level, but had been disappointingly short of its target for admissions to doctoral courses. The pattern observed was consistent with colleges favouring the admission of doctoral students, leaving the graduate colleges with a disproportionately high share of one-year graduate students and a relatively lower proportion of doctoral students. The paper gave some suggestions as to how the College might increase the number of doctoral students giving Hughes as their first choice of College and the President opened discussion for Fellows to offer their views and ideas.

A number of suggestions were made and the President proposed that a Work Strand be set up to collate the ideas and views expressed and instigate their implementation. He requested that Fellows contact him if they wished to be included on the Work Strand.

**ACTION:** The Secretary to note the suggestions made during the discussion and pass to the Work Strand.

**55.11.** Minutes of committees

The minutes of the following committees were received:

* College Council, of Wednesday 22 March 2017 (GB55 08)
* College Council, of Wednesday 26 April 2017 (GB55 09)
* Fellowships Committee, 3 May 2017 (GB55 10)
* Fellowships Committee, 24 May 2017 (GB55 11)
* Governance Committee, 1 February 2017 (GB55 12)
Dr Lockhart asked for further clarification of College Council minute 67.6.2 that appeared to imply that those holding the newly created role of Associate Tutor would be considered to be Officers of the College and members of the Academic Staff. The President clarified that this had not been the intention and it was agreed that the minute should be rephrased and approved at the next meeting of Council.

**ACTION:** The Secretary to request that Council make the appropriate amendment to the minute.

**55.12.** Annual report of the Remuneration Committee (GB55 15)

The President reminded Governing Body that the remit of Remuneration Committee had changed since the previous year and that it no longer made recommendations on individual salary levels, but rather recommended a range of scale points for each College Officer and Post Holder: decisions concerning the remuneration of individuals would be made by the President in consultation with the Vice-President and Pro-Vice-President.

[REDACTED]

Each of the College Post Holders present left the room whilst Governing Body considered the recommendation for College Post Holders. The Bursar and the Senior Tutor left the room whilst Governing Body considered the recommendation for their respective offices. The President did not withdraw because he had opted not to receive a salary, but abstained from voting on the recommendation for the remuneration of the office of President. Those holding the Office of Tutor left the room whilst Governing Body considered the recommendation for Tutors and the Deputy Praelector left the room whilst Governing Body considered the recommendation for the Praelector and Deputy Praelector. The Praelector, Dr Gehring, was not present.

Governing Body approved all of the recommendations.

**55.13.** Annual report of the Academic Convenor (GB55 16)

Dr Sargent spoke briefly to the paper and thanked the Research Convenors for their organisation and support of events throughout the year.

There were no further questions or comments.

**55.14.** Finances: Update (GB55 17)

The Bursar presented the Management Accounts for the period 1 August 2016 to 30 April 2017.

**55.15.** Any other Open Business

There was no other open business.

End of Open Business WS 14/06/2017
RESERVED BUSINESS

[REDACTED]

End of Reserved Business WS 14/06/2017
Appendix A: Changes to College Ordinances approved by Governing Body

C,II,18(i)

18. The Development Director shall be responsible to the Council for the efficient and effective operation of the Development Office and its activities. The Council shall determine the duties of the Development Director, from time to time, provided that these shall normally include:
(a) fund raising, in co-ordination with the President;
(b) Alumni relations;
(c) donor recognition and stewardship;
(d) administration of donations, under the provisions of Ordinance [B,VIII];
(e) strategic planning for development objectives in the College;
(f) external communications on behalf of the College, both with donors and potential donors and with other persons and bodies;
(g) the development budget;
(h) day-to-day management of the Development Office and its staff;
(i) the work of the Strategic Development Strategy Group, as Secretary.

D,I,1(c)

1. For the avoidance of doubt, Part D of these Ordinances shall not apply to the Governing Body or to the Council except where these bodies are expressly mentioned. There shall be three levels of committee: Governing Body (GB) committees, College Council (CC) committees and advisory committees.
(a) GB committees shall be the Governance Committee, the Fellowships Committee, the Audit Committee and the Remuneration Committee (see Parts A & B);
(b) CC committees shall be the Finance Committee, the Investments Committee, the Admissions Committee, the Scholarships Committee, the Estates Committee and the Study Centres Committee;
(c) the advisory committees shall be the House Committee, the Strategic Development Strategy Group, the Staff Strategy Committee and any other advisory committees established by the Council from time to time.

D,III,5-7

Strategic-Development Strategy Group

5. The Strategic-Development Strategy Group (SDDS Group) shall be an advisory committee to the Development Director, appointed in accordance with Ordinance [D,I]. The Committee shall meet at least once a Term and shall be composed of:
(a) the President (Chair);
(b) the Development Director;
(c) the Bursar;
(d) one Alumnus;
(e) one Student nominated by the MCR;
(f) up to two co-opted members, drawn from the Leaders/Directors of Focus Areas and College Study Centres.

6. The **SDDSg** shall provide information, advice and support on matters relating to College development policy and strategy, including:

7. The **SDDSg** may, where appropriate, establish and oversee other development groups, for the purposes of advancing fund-raising objectives; in particular, a Global Development Group operating within the strategic objectives set by the **SDDSg**. Any expenditure on or by any development group shall normally be authorised in advance by the Council.

**B,VI,8 (e)**

(e) review the annual College Accounts prior to their presentation to the Governing Body at the Audit Meeting and subsequent approval by the Council;

**B,VI,5**

5. The Committee shall report to the Governing Body as necessary; and, in respect of the external audit of the annual accounts, shall report as soon as practicable after the audit has been completed, normally at the first a meeting of the Governing Body in the Michaelmas Term.

**A,V,2**

2. An Audit Meeting under Statute [II,3] shall be held during the Michaelmas Term, normally in October, on some suitable date prior to the publication of the annual College accounts. Three further meetings shall be held, one in Michaelmas Term, and two others, normally in the last week of each Full Term in Lent and Easter Terms.

**B,VI,3**

3. The committee shall be quorate when at least half of the membership is present. The Bursar, when present, shall act as administrative secretary. In the absence of the Bursar the Committee shall appoint a minutes’ secretary from among the members, for the purposes of that meeting or that item only.
5. The Estates Committee shall be a standing committee of the Council, appointed in accordance with Ordinance [D,I]. The Committee shall normally meet once a Term. The Committee shall be composed of:
   (a) the President (Chair);
   (b) the Vice-President or the Pro-Vice-President;
   (c) the Bursar;
   (d) the Head of Facilities;
   (e) four further GB Fellows;
   (f) one Student nominated by the MCR Committee;
   (g) up to two co-opted members with expertise in property development, funding or property maintenance.

6. The House Committee shall be an advisory committee to the Bursar, appointed in accordance with Ordinance [D,I], and shall be composed of:
   (a) one member of the Council (Chair);
   (b) the Bursar;
   (c) the Senior Tutor;
   (d) the Head of Domestic Operations
   (e) four further members appointed from among the GB Fellows and Research Associates;
   (f) up to three Students nominated by the MCR Committee.